# **CTE BOARD MEETING - MINUTES**

Monday, August 1, 2016 1:00 – 1:30 Conference Call: 1-877-820-7831 Participant: 917161#

Attendees: Jon Pierpont, Giselle Jackson, Carrie Mayne, Jeremias Solari, Kathy Bounous, Rich Thorn, Denese Lacey, Jared Haines, Senator Ann Millner, Representative Richard Cunningham, Ben Hart, Greg Paras, Brenda Voisard

#### Absent:

#	Agenda Item	Presenter
1	Welcome  Jon chaired the meeting per vice chair Millner	Rich Cunningham
2	Approval of minutes  Motioned: Senator Ann Millner Seconded: Rich Thorn Approved unanimously.	Rich Cunningham
3	Progress Update Timeline for report is on schedule.  Data Received and Completed in Mid-July  Inventory of programs  Description of programs  Materials and equipment  Funding  Description  Geographic location  Student completers  Cost per membership hour  Analysis [all data to be provided stratisfied by source]  Student completers, between the target years of 2011 – 2015  Divided into three main groups  New Entrants [employment effect of education]  No UI records during the four quarters before and the quarter of graduation  New entrants mean new people entering the workforce.  Non-traditional (borrowing a term from the education) [wage effect of education]  UI records during the four quarters before and or quarter of graduation  Multiple Degree Holders [marginal effect of education]  Individuals who earned more than one	Carrie Mayne Jeremias Solari

- degree in the target years of 2011-2015
- Subdivided into five groups based on temporality of degree completion, and volume of degrees completed
  - Temporal grouping
    - Identical
    - Within one year
    - Outside of a year
  - Volume grouping
    - Two
    - Three or more
- Analysis conducted
  - o New entrants
    - Post-graduation job retention
    - Post-graduation job placement
    - Post-graduation no UI record (proxy of unemployment)
  - Non-traditional
    - Pre and post-graduation wage behavior
    - Pre and post average wage
    - Wage growth
    - Pre and post-graduation no UI record (proxy for unemployment)
  - Multiple Degree Holders
    - Calculated pre and post average wage for the five unique multiple degree holders group
    - Compared group AA (same time, two degrees) and AB (same time, three degrees) to single degree holders
    - Compared BA, BB, CA and CB [within a year and outside of a year, and two or more degrees] within entity.

Brenda Voisard asked if when we reference degrees that also refers to certificates?

Jeremias Solari said yes.

### Future analysis

- Wage behavior by CIP family
  - Top five and bottom five CIP families by average pre and post wages, demarked by STEM and non-STEM fields
- Wage behavior by IPEDS level
  - Elucidate on the employment and wage outcomes associated with differing levels of education as defined by IPEDS
- 10-year occupational projections compared to current CIP-to-SOC degree output
  - Evidence for or against the proper alignment of education and the private sector.

	Next steps – in touch with data providers to ensure proper analysis and interpretation of data.	
	On target for November 1 report due deadline.	
4	Q & A Carrie opened it up for questions, comments or concerns. Brenda: How are people who went through CTE programs at the high schools being tracked? Can we get that data or is it included? Unfortunately, since USOE does not track by ssn, we are unable to match that to a wage record and therefore not included in the data. USOE's CTE outcomes will be included, but not in the wage analysis.  Jon asked if we can get that data some other way?  Millner Can the Utah Data Alliance (UDA) help with the unique id to each student? Carrie – The unique ID given to students is not trackable. UDA helps the matching on demographic information only. They can track it back IF the CTE high school person moved on to higher ed.  Rich Thorn – how do we get good data to see the trends of kids from k-12 in CTE programs to the workforce and properly inform kids on career options.  Cunningham – the data is to help find out if the CTE programs are designed properly to get folks into CTE fields.  Carrie – we would need SSN's? Carrie – if the student is in the UCAT system, then we will have their data.  Rich – what about the non-UCAT Carrie – We also use the IPED's system, which includes private sector educational institutions, such as apprentice programs administered through those institutions.  Rich – What about internal apprentice programs in the employer through DOL and the employee will receive credentials? Carrie – yes, we could if DOL reports SSN's and match that back to UI records.  Jared Haines - UCAT and USHE are required to report on placements, so they might have helpful data?  Jeremias - We would be using different methodology and therefore date would not be congruent.  Next Steps  Next steps: rough draft on track to 9/15. Clean version needs to be at communications 10/1 for finalization. Board members would need to	Rich Cunningham
	Communications 10/1 for illianzation, Doute memoris would need to	

review and feedback around Oct. 1. DWS will circulate the draft to board members.

Jon - Would we want to meet in person for feedback or is email ok? Group decided to meet in person mid-October.

Cunningham would like to have the report reviewed and then meet for recommendations on any legislation that needs to be drafted for strategy.

Millner would like to meet in person before the report is completely finalized. Review what direction this board should take from what we learned from the report.

Kathy – reminded the group the legislation requires the report be finalized and circulated to several entities on November 1.

Jon summarized – Report draft is on target to be reviewed internally by 9/15 and will be sent via email to CTE Board members the week of 9/26 for feedback due 10/1. Final product is set for publication and distribution on the 11/1 deadline.

#### Set next meeting

Next meeting mid-October.

ACTION: Giselle will get date options from the Chair and Vice Chair.

Millner would like to get the on an Education Interim Committee meeting agenda for a formal presentation. Want to have recommendations for funding in front of legislature.

Kathy suggested the interim meeting after 2017 General Session might be the best time to present to give time to strategize and come up with recommendations after reviewing the final report and hearing feedback from the entities the report is circulated to.

Millner and Cunningham would like even a draft presentation to the interim in October, even if the report is not final. Hesitate to meet in May because this report might have impacts on funding to various education entities, such as public education, UCAT and USHE.

Cunningham would like to meet before the  $3^{\rm rd}$  week of October.

## **Closing Comments – Adjourn**

Richard Cunningham adjourned the meeting.